**OPEN MINUTE OF GLASGOW URBAN DESIGN PANEL MEETING**

| | |
|---|---|
| **DATE:** | 13th November 2008 at 1000hrs |
| **LOCATION:** | Committee Room 3, Glasgow City Chambers |
| **CHAIR:** | Alistair MacDonald, Glasgow City Council |

**PRESENT:**

| | |
|---|---|
| Alistair MacDonald | Glasgow City Council (chair) |
| Tom McNichols | Strathclyde Police |
| David Martin | Church Buildings Regeneration Trust |
| Neil Pirrit | Architectural Heritage Society of Scotland |
| James Watson | Landscape Institute |
| David Porter | MacIntosh School of Architecture |
| Peter Trowles | MacIntosh School of Architecture |
| Angela Williams | Architecture & Design Scotland |
| Niall Murphy | Pollokshields Heritage |
| Karin Spalter | Pollokshields Heritage |
| Steve Tiesdell | SOCSI |
| Liz Davidson | Merchant City Initiative |
| Julia Fenby | Lighthouse Architecture and Design Centre |
| Martin McKay | Glasgow Institute of Architects (new chair) |
| Angus Kerr | Glasgow Institute of Architects |
| David Hasson | Glasgow Institute of Architects |
| James Dick | Glasgow Institute of Architects |
| Murray Russell | Glasgow Institute of Architects |
| Jude Barber | Glasgow Institute of Architects |

**IN ATTENDANCE:**

| | |
|---|---|
| Mark Thomson | Glasgow City Council Planning |
| Kevin McCormack | Glasgow City Council Planning |
| Louise Pasi | Glasgow City Council Planning |

**1) OPENING REMARKS**

Mr MacDonald opened the meeting and thanked everyone for their attendance. Mr MacDonald confirmed that Gerry Grams would be unable to attend future meetings until further notice due to prior Glasgow City Council commitments.

**2) APOLOGIES**

Apologies were received from Gerry Grams (Glasgow City Council) Geoffrey Jarvis (Glasgow Architectural Committee), Nick Barley (Lighthouse), Ranald MacInnes (Historic Scotland), Ombretta Romice, University of Strathclyde, Alan Simpson, (Glasgow School of Art) and Gill Stewart (Glasgow Building Preservation Trust)

**3) MINUTES OF PREVIOUS MEETING**

The circulated minutes of the previous meeting were accepted as a true and accurate record.

**4) MATTERS ARISING**

Mr MacDonald stressed the importance of timeous receipt of Project Reports from the Panel. It was agreed that reports should be forwarded to Mr McDonald within 2 weeks of any previous meeting.

**5) PROPOSAL: BUCHANAN GALLERIES REDEVELOPMENT**
**AGENT: BDP FOR GVA GRIMLEY**
Presented by Gary Mappin of GVA Grimley and Alistair Murray of BDP Architects
**ADDRESS: 220 BUCHANAN STREET, GLASGOW**
**STATUS: PRE-APPLICATION**

It was explained that outline planning consent for the scheme had been granted 3 weeks previously. AM outlined the existing position and performance of Buchanan Galleries in a retail context. The new scheme assessed how the expansion of the Galleries could reinvigorate the city centre and the shopping complex itself. The scheme proposed the re-development of Buchanan Street Bus Station on 4 levels over a new bus station, a new multi-storey car park and a new entrance atrium and public realm space on Buchanan Street plus links from and to Queen Street Station, with an improved side entrance and upgrading of Dundas Street Lane. A new anchor store was proposed and an expanded catering level and 10 screen cinema. The scheme proposed to re-introduce new 'active' frontages along Cathedral Street and upgrade the undercroft on this street plus remaining East West/North South routes. The removal of the Concert Hall steps and the re-ordering of these within a new glass drum would involve the relocation of public seating further south. The elevations were to be 'wrapped' with feature lighting particularly at the glazed corners and at the retail showcase levels.

**Issues raised:**

- James Bruce Watson asked whether there would be public access to the roofs, whether it would be a green roof and whether there would be 24-hour access to the development. Answer that the operational hours of the Galleries would extended from the present retail only opening times due to the presence of the multi-screen cinema.
- David Martin asked whether there were any plans to enliven the existing facades of the Concert Hall. GVAG responded that they were in discussions with the Concert Hall re. potential for internal and external improvements.
- David Porter asked whether the scheme could have an impact in unlocking the potential of Renfrew Street, which links the GSA with the RSAMD etc.
- Peter Trowles asked whether there were any plans for the existing multi-storey next to the bus station; there is potential to include this within the scheme but no firm plans to do so at present.
- Niall Murphy asked whether there would be likely to be significant loss to the footfall of upper Sauchiehall Street if M&S closed down to re-locate into the new development and commented on the loss of the Concert Hall steps, which currently provide a useful external seating area for people. The entrance hall drum has been planned to relate largely to the Concert Hall;
- David Hasson made the point that this atrium has now become a privatised and therefore non- public space but that the use of the space as public in ambience should be enshrined as far as possible. He went on to ask whether there would be any smaller units entranced from the street only as in a traditional shopping route rather than internally from the mall - response that Killermont Street is planned to support this type of unit.
- Alistair MacDonald added that it would be difficult to predict the impact of any loss of M&S on the street in such a chaotic commercial market and forecast that a truer picture of the current situation will not in itself be possible until after February 09.
- Murray Russell considered that the scheme was still too resembling of a large out of town shopping centre and had amalgamated the city blocks without allowing sufficient permeability and that overall both facades and roofline were bland. If there were to be internal streets - these should be accessible 24 hours a day. GVAG responded that the

design was seeking to drive movement pattern through the blocks but that it was impossible to drive the patterns of the city grid through the centre.

- Neil Pirrit questioned whether the statue of Donald Dewar would be affected. This will remain in-situ and other public art applications are being examined.
- Jude Barber questioned the need for a bridge between the two blocks and argued that it would be better to engage pedestrians at ground floor street level with both sides of the development.
- Tom McNichol asked whether vehicular traffic could be removed altogether from Cathedral Street given the ongoing structural issues over the Queen St/Cathedral Street Bridge. Alistair Macdonald replied that the discussions regarding liability for the bridge were still ongoing between the Council and network Rail but that it was an important public transport route for SPT.

The presentation concluded and Alistair MacDonald thanked the architects and agents for their time.

**6) PROPOSAL: SAVOY CENTRE REDEVELOPMENT AND PROPOSED HOTEL/ OFFICE BUILDING**
**AGENT: SUJEET SHARMA**
Pat Kenny from PBN Property Ltd and John Lee from Sujeet Sharma/Paul Worthington Architects
**ADDRESS: SAVOY CENTRE, RENFREW STREET, GLASGOW**
**STATUS: PRE-APPLICATION**

The architect noted that their client had acquired the Savoy Centre building in February 2007. It was the intention to improve the design, operation and commercial viability of the site. The architects described the existing 1960/70's Savoy Centre building to be commercially inflexible and aesthetically brutal. The immediate surrounding context was described as an emerging cultural quarter (Glasgow School of Art, Academy of Music, CCA) but with poor pedestrian flow and low quality facades.
The architects hoped to remove the existing footbridge over Renfrew Street, create a focus to the corner of Renfrew Street/Hope Street and provide a ground level pedestrian link between Sauchiehall Street and Renfrew Street.
It was proposed that the existing building be refurbished. Existing long-lease tenants would be retained within an upgraded, interior arrangement. These would be linked at ground floor to a new hotel lobby, bar and office entrance via a new internal arcade. A new tower would be situated above the Hope Street/Renfrew Street corner of the site housing 220 hotel rooms and 65-70,000 sqft of offices.

**Issues raised**:

- David Hasson highlighted that no contextual information had been provided within the presentation.
- Jim Dick requested clarification regarding the height of the tower building. The architect confirmed this to be 109 storeys. Jim Dick highlighted that the proposed tower would most likely be the tallest building in Glasgow noting that this would have a significant effect on the Glasgow skyline. Jim Dick noted that wind and day-lighting studies would also be required highlighting that a tower development in Elphinstone Place had altered several times due to the results of extensive wind studies.
- Jude Barber suggested that the link between Sauchiehall Street and Renfrew Street was not an arcade but rather a corridor opening into a Hotel lobby. It was suggested that examples of successful arcades could be investigated (height, width, shop-fronts) to maximise the potential pedestrian link and create a fully accessible route.
- Moray Russell noted that the 'stacked' tower bore no relation to the surrounding context and expressed disappointment at the lack of contextual information and urban analysis.

The presentation concluded and Alistair MacDonald thanked the architects and agents for their time.

**7) PROPOSAL: PROPOSED RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT**
**AGENT: ELDER AND CANNON**
Presented by Tom Connelly and Steven Hoy
**ADDRESS: 71-75 VIRGINIA STREET/PLACE, GLASGOW**
**STATUS: APPLICATION**

It was explained that the proposed development consisted of 57 new build residential units. The long-standing gap site sat to the South of George Square to the rear of the Corinthian building at the corner of a pedestrian route between Wilson Street and Virginia Street. The architects presented a variety of historical maps. Exposed gables of varying height surrounded the site. The architects noted that they wished to reinstate a strong street edge and form a new rear courtyard. The new building could also mediate between Miller Street and lower Merchant City buildings. An L-shaped plan with habitable rooms to the street, bedrooms and circulation to the rear sat over a basement car park basement.
A series of contextual elevations and sections were presented to demonstrate the impact on surrounding context and the proposed anodised aluminium elevational treatment (shades of bronze and brass). A series of glass 'cubes' formed a stepped roofscape.

**Issues raised**:

- David Porter welcomed the well-considered building and presentation.
- David Martin considered the aluminium panels to be an innovative, contemporary method of relating the new building to its surrounding context.
- Jude Barber asked whether day-lighting studies had been carried out to assess the impact the new building might have on surrounding properties. The architects confirmed that compliant studies had been carried out.
- David Hasson requested clarification of the ground floor plinth. The architect explained that the building had been elevated along Virginia Street to relate to the existing car parking levels on Virginia Place
- Liz Davidson noted that Virginia Lane was in a poor state of repair and suggested that the new building could act as a catalyst for surrounding public realm improvements, potentially via Res3 funds.

The presentation concluded and Alistair MacDonald thanked the architects for their time.

**8) PROPOSAL: GLASGOW HARBOUR MIXED USE DEVELOPMENT**
**AGENT: CHAPMAN TAYLOR FOR DRIVAS JONAS**
Presented by Chapman Taylor and Lynsey Ashcroft of Drivas Jonas
**ADDRESS: GLASGOW HARBOUR EAST AT CASTLEBANK QUAY/ YORKHILL QUAY**
**STATUS: OUTLINE APPLICATION**

The architects highlighted that this was their second presentation to the Panel. In light of new panel members being present the architects explained the proposal from first principles. The architects highlighted that the proposed development sat on existing brownfield land at the convergence of the River Kelvin and the Clyde. The site was separated from the hinterland by roads, railways and water. The mixed-use proposals sought to open the area to become a new, waterfront destination.
The development consisted of a serious of uses – residential, commercial and retail – with new buildings arranged around three principle squares – Event Square, Entrance Square and Central Square. The proposal also linked to Glasgow Harbour's existing Phase 1 Linear Park. Office/Residential buildings sat to the South overlooking the Clyde. A Retail

block sat between Entrance and Event Squares linked by a covered, 24 hour accessible 'street' at ground level. A large Hotel/Casino was located to the East of the site adjacent to the developing Transport Museum. The architect highlighted that the proposed 6-storey car park had been reduced in height further to previous concerns regarding views. Inner Roads had also been removed to create a pedestrian friendly environment.

**Issues raised**:

- Karin Spalter welcomed the introduction of a development on such a challenging, brownfield site.
- Jude Barber highlighted that the proposals were remarkably similar to the pre-application development previously presented to the Panel.
- James Bruce Watson asked whether bus parking had been introduced. The architect confirmed that car parking was located at basement level with ground level access for school mini-buses etc. Public Transport would be located at the periphery of the site on key arteries.
- Jim Dick asked whether Phasing had been considered. The Agent confirmed that the Retail/Residential elements would be developed as one Phase due to the construction of the basement car park.
- David Hasson asked for clarification of use at ground floor level of the Casino. The architect confirmed that this would be Level 2 parking with restaurants facing immediately onto the public space.

The presentation concluded and Alistair MacDonald thanked the architects and agents for their time.

**9) AOCB**

9.1 GUDP Evening: Angus Kerr proposed another GUDP evening be held early 2009 further to the success of the previous year's event. A provisional date of Thursday 29th January was agreed. Angus agreed to forward further details (venue, cost, etc) early January.

9.2 Rob Hay, Strathclyde Police: The Panel wished to congratulate Rob Hay from Strathclyde Police on his recent promotion.

**10) DATE & TIME OF NEXT MEETING**

The date of the next meeting is Thursday 29th January 2009, Committee Room 3, Glasgow City Council at 9.30am.